

**CLIMATE CHANGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MEETING MINUTES**

Sept. 13, 2016

10:00 a.m. – 2:00 p.m.

Conference Room 105

Rachel Carson State Office Building

MEMBERS/ALTERNATES PRESENT:

Chairperson Steve Krug, Vice-Chairperson Mark Hammond, Sarah Nicholas, Joe Sherrick, Paul Opiyo, Terry Bossert, George Ellis, Rob Graff, Patrick Henderson, Grant Gulibon (alternate for Luke Brubaker), Richard Fox (alternate for Rep. Greg Vitali), and Meredith Graham (alternate for Michael Winek)

MEMBERS/ALTERNATES ABSENT:

Gary Merritt, Rep. Ryan Bizzaro, Jim Warner, Steve Winberg

PROXY VOTING:

None

PA DEP AND COMMONWEALTH AGENCY STAFF:

Frank Purtell (DEP), John Krueger (DEP), Jessica Shirley (DEP), Dennis Maloskey (DEP), Katherine Hetherington Cunfer (DEP), Sharon Trostle (DEP), Rhonda Manning (DEP), Doug Zimmerman (PennDOT)

MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC:

Dan Szekeres (Michael Baker Inc.), Bob Barkanic (The Barkanic Group, Inc.), Evan Endres (The Nature Conservancy), Lisa Jacobson (Business Council for Sustainable Energy)

REGULAR MEETING:

The Sept. 13, 2016, regular meeting of the Climate Change Advisory Committee (CCAC) was called to order at 10:05 a.m. by Chairperson Steve Krug. Roll call was taken and, with 9 of 13 seated members present at the start of the meeting, a quorum was established. Members, DEP staff and guests introduced themselves.

MINUTES:

The minutes for the July 12, 2016, CCAC meeting were presented to the committee for approval by Mr. Krug. After a brief correction of two typographical errors, a motion to accept the minutes was made by Mr. Ellis and was seconded. The motion carried by voice vote. Ms. Graham abstained as Mr. Winek was not present for the July 12 meeting.

MEETING SUMMARY: (This narrative provides a summary of the discussions that took place during the meeting. It is not a transcript of the proceedings.)

AGENCY PRESENTATIONS:

Mr. Douglas Zimmerman, PennDOT's Office of Planning offered the CCAC a PowerPoint presentation on the PennDOT Extreme Weather Vulnerability Study. The goal of the study is to

better anticipate the consequences and impacts of extreme weather, identify funding priorities to improve resiliency, and identify potential adaptation strategies to reduce overall risk of extreme weather events. Federal guidelines require planners to consider system resiliency and the effects of climate change on a proposed action. Mr. Zimmerman highlighted the many state, federal, and educational stakeholders that have had input in this study. The overall study is scheduled to be completed by December of 2016.

Mr. Zimmerman outlined the types of weather impacts considered in this study: flooding, snow, heat, and mud/rock slides. The primary form of extreme weather that impacts roadways in Pennsylvania is flooding. Mr. Zimmerman discussed the process for data collection in this study, including the linkage of NOAA precipitation and road closure data. Three counties (Allegheny, Lycoming, and Delaware) were evaluated for possible changes in future 100-year floodplains due to climate change models. Mr. Zimmerman shared a series of adaptation strategy ideas and goals for PennDOT based on this study.

The President of the Business Council for Sustainable Energy, Ms. Lisa Jacobson, offered the CCAC a PowerPoint presentation on energy production and consumption trends on the national and state level. The presentation shared several graphs from Bloomberg New Energy Finance. On a national level, 2015 power-sector greenhouse gas emissions are approximately 18% below 2005 levels. National, regional, and state electricity prices were also displayed over the past ten years, showing that Pennsylvania's prices have remained competitive over that time. Several graphs displaying Pennsylvania-specific data on fuel source for electric generation, amount of electricity exported, natural gas production and power-sector consumption, renewable energy additions and total capacity, utility energy efficiency, and range of costs for various forms of electrical generation were also presented. Ms. Jacobson also provided copies and answered questions concerning *State Energy Fact Sheet: Pennsylvania*, which was published by Bloomberg New Energy Finance in June of 2016.

Dennis Maloskey, representing the PA DEP State Energy Office, offered the CCAC a PowerPoint presentation on the function of the State Energy Office and an outline of the 2016-2017 State Energy Plan. The presentation highlighted Pennsylvania's energy mix both by sector and by fuel type. Mr. Maloskey indicated that the 2016-2017 State Energy Plan will consist of six major projects, four of which are tied to work plans / recommendations from the 2015 Climate Change Action Plan Update. Mr. Maloskey went into detail on each of the major projects (Combined Heat & Power, Energy Assessments for Small/Medium Manufacturers, Small Business Energy Assessments/Retrofits, Building Operator Training, PA State Agency Energy Planning and Evaluation, Measurement and Verification, and Energy Emergency Assuredness/Planning). Mr. Maloskey also touched on several other programs associated with the State Energy Office (Financing, Technical Assistance, Transportation, Energy Efficiency, and Renewable Energy).

MEMBERSHIP UPDATE:

The CCAC now carries eight vacancies (four from Governor, two from Senate majority, and two from Senate minority) along with one appointed seat expiring in 2016 on its membership roster. DEP continues to work on filling these vacancies.

2015 CLIMATE CHANGE ACTION PLAN (Update):

The 2015 Climate Change Action Plan Update was presented to the Governor on August 19, 2016. A printed, bound copy of the Update was available for each committee member. The committee had a

brief discussion concerning the feedback received by committee members after the release of the Update. The committee and the Department both indicated that they received very little feedback from the public after the release of the Update. The committee was encouraged to promote the Update among interested parties within the Commonwealth.

DEVELOPMENT OF THE 2018 CLIMATE CHANGE ACTION PLAN UPDATE:

The committee and the Department had a discussion centered on the statutory requirements of Act 70 in regards to the timeframe for the 2018 Climate Change Action Plan Update. The Department indicated it's choice to operate under the interpretation that the deadline for the next Update will be Oct. 9, 2018, and not August 19, 2019. Several members of the committee expressed concern over the Oct. 9, 2018 deadline decision. The Department expressed that the concerns of the committee were heard and had been considered when this decision was made. The Department intends to draft a timeline for completing the Update and share this timeline with the committee. It was also noted by the Department that a final draft of the 2018 Climate Change Action Plan Update will need to be available for public review and comment by early 2018 to allow for the public comment period and any necessary revisions if the Oct. 9, 2018, deadline is to be met.

The committee and the Department also had a discussion on the inclusion of adaptation in the 2018 Climate Change Action Plan Update. A general agreement was reached that the 2018 Update should include an overview of adaptation measures currently in place within the Department and within other agencies throughout the Commonwealth. The Update could also highlight adaptation practices being instituted at the county and city levels within the Commonwealth and in other States. Members of the committee advised that, unless the mitigation and adaptation analysis and recommendations occurred in parallel, the schedule would not be met.

The use of outside contractors for aid in the development of the next update was also discussed. Some areas that an outside contractor could help the 2018 Update are evaluating the success of previous work plans, proposing new ideas for future work plans, proposing new types of designs for future plans, evaluating similar demographic states for effective work plans, and evaluating adaptation plans. The Department will be in contact with the Georgetown Climate Center for possible consultation in securing a contractor. The Department indicated that there is funding available during the current fiscal year (2016-17) for consultation work.

The committee members provided feedback on previous work plans that should be analyzed for effectiveness for discussion at the next Committee meeting. Committee members recommended that all work plans from the 2009 and 2013 reports be analyzed, except those with an annual greenhouse gas emission reduction of less than one million metric tons of carbon dioxide equivalent or greater. The evaluation would include whether the work plan had been implemented (either partially or fully) and an analysis of the effectiveness of the implemented work plans. The committee and Department also discussed evaluating work plans that had not been implemented for potential cost-effectiveness as a possible next step in this evaluation, with the goal of identifying what has worked best to achieve change, i.e., "what can move the needle".

The committee members also continued to make suggestions that the Clean Power Plan (CPP) and methane control strategies be significant topics addressed in the 2018 Update.

Committee Members will be able to organize expert stakeholders upon determination of the 2018 Update elements and volunteer to review and advise on specific topics at any time. The successes and limitations of the committee's prior use of subcommittees was discussed.

ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS:

The two-year terms for the current committee Chairperson and Vice-Chairperson will expire at the next meeting. An election will need to be held at the Nov. 1, 2016 meeting for these roles.

Committee member Paul Opiyo offered to contact the Commonwealth Financing Authority in regards to a possible presentation at the Nov.1 meeting on a recently released solar market report.

The Department will be in contact with Georgetown Climate Center in regards to a presentation at the Nov. 1 meeting on the organization's ability to support the committee and the Department in development of the 2018 Update.

Preliminary 2017 meeting dates were discussed; DEP will provide 2017 meeting dates to the committee pending confirmation of room availability.

PUBLIC COMMENT(S):

There were no public comments during the meeting.

ADJOURNMENT:

A motion to adjourn was made by Mr. Sherrick and seconded. The motion carried, and the meeting was adjourned at 2:35 p.m.