

**CLIMATE CHANGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MEETING MINUTES**

December 4, 2017

10:00 a.m. – 2:00 p.m.

Conference Room 105

Rachel Carson State Office Building

MEMBERS/ALTERNATES PRESENT:

Chairperson Steve Krug, Sara Nicholas, Joseph Sherrick, Adam Walters (alternate for Paul Opiyo), Lindsay Baxter, Vice-Chairperson Terry Bossert, Grant Gulibon (alternate for Luke Brubaker), Zakia Elliott, George Ellis, Robert Graff, Mark Hammond, Patrick Henderson, Marc Mondor, and Meredith Graham (alternate for Mike Winek)

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Rep. Ryan Bizzaro, Gary Merritt

PROXY VOTING:

None

PA DEP STAFF:

John Krueger, Mark Brojakowski, Jessica Shirley, Jennie Demjanick, David Althoff, Kerry Campbell, Lee Ann Murray, Cheryl Vazquez

INVITED GUESTS: Cory Jemison and Harry Vides (ICF Inc.)

MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC:

Bob Barkanic (The Barkanic Group, LLC)

REGULAR MEETING:

The December 4, 2017, regular meeting of the Climate Change Advisory Committee (CCAC) was called to order at 10:07 a.m. by Chairperson Steve Krug. With 11 of 14 seated members present at the start of the meeting, a quorum was established. The afternoon session was chaired by Mr. Bossert, Vice-Chairperson.

MINUTES:

The minutes of the August 7, 2017, CCAC meeting were presented to the committee by Mr. Krug for approval. Mr. Graff commented on the minutes being a summary of the meeting rather than “minutes.” Mr. Brojakowski clarified the definition of “minutes” and what is contained in minutes according to Robert’s Rules of Order. The CCAC meeting minutes as presented contain all the elements of the definition and therefore are meeting minutes. In addition, Mr. Graff suggested that there should be a distinction between members of the public, invited guests and DEP’s contractor, ICF, categorized in the minutes. A motion to accept the minutes, as presented, was made by Mr. Sherrick and was seconded. The motion carried by voice vote.

MEETING SUMMARY: (This narrative provides a summary of the discussions that took place during the meeting. It is not a transcript of the proceedings.)

MEMBERSHIP UPDATE:

With the resignation of Mr. Steve Winberg, the CCAC now carries five vacancies (one from Senate majority, one from Senate minority, one from the House minority and two from the House majority). DEP continues to work on filling these vacancies.

PA AGENCY PRESENTATIONS:

Combined Heat and Power (CHP)

Mr. Joe Sherrick of the Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission (PUC) offered the CCAC an overview of CHP in the Commonwealth. The purpose of Mr. Sherrick's presentation was to ensure that the Committee membership shared the same understanding concerning CHP vs combined cycle vs cogeneration (CHP) vs co-firing. Mr. Sherrick answered specific questions posed by Committee members. In addition to the CHP overview, Mr. Sherrick shared with the Committee the performance metric of the 8th round of Act 129. This metric will be part of the PUC's Annual Report to be released in February 2018.

OUTSIDE AGENCY PRESENTATION:

City of Pittsburgh Resilience and Sustainability:

Sarah Yeager of the City of Pittsburgh's Department of City Planning offered a presentation about Pittsburgh's Resilience and Sustainability program.

100 Resilient Cities:

100 Resilient Cities defines urban resilience as the capacity of individuals, communities, institutions, businesses and systems within a city to survive, adapt and grow no matter what kind of chronic stresses and acute shocks they experience. Through the Rockefeller Foundation, Pittsburgh has become a member of the 100 Resilient Cities Network. The values of being a 100 Resilient Cities network member include: 1) Chief Resilience Officer and staff, 2) planning support: The Rand Corporation, 3) implementation support: platform partners - \$5m in services, and 4) membership in network of 100 cities.

ONEPGH Resilient Pittsburgh Plan:

The products of ONEPGH are the Preliminary Resilience Assessment and the Resilience Strategy. The Resilience Assessment identifies the shocks and stresses associated with the changing environmental issues in Pittsburgh. Shocks include climate change and extreme weather, infrastructure collapse, hazmat accidents and economic collapse. Stresses include economic and racial inequity, fragmentation and environmental degradation. The P4 concept, "People, Places, Planet and Performance," gives values to Pittsburgh's resilience objectives. The strategy pushes forward existing actions and supplements with new initiatives. Strategy, Initiate, Coordinate, Amplify, and Accelerate are the steps of the resilience objectives. Each of these steps has a specific role in the strategy.

Pittsburgh Climate Action Plan (CAP):

The CAP outlines goals for Pittsburgh and Emission Reduction Goals. Pittsburgh's 2030 goals are divided into two categories:

City Operations goals: 100% renewable energy use, 100% fossil fuel-free fleet, divestment of city pensions in fossil fuels.

Citywide: 50% energy and waste use reduction, 50% transportation emissions reduction, zero waste. Emissions Reduction goals include: 20% GHG Reduction by 2023, 50% GHG Reduction by 2030, 80% GHG Reduction by 2050.

Pittsburgh's Greenhouse Gas Inventory:

The most recent Greenhouse Gas Inventory developed for the city of Pittsburgh utilizes 2013 emissions data. Past GHG inventories were developed in 2003 and 2008. In comparison to the previous GHG inventories, Pittsburgh has experienced a 12% increase in GHG emissions from 2003 and a 10% increase in GHG emissions from 2008.

Pittsburgh Climate Action Plan Format:

Pittsburgh's Climate Action Plan is formatted by sector(s): 1) Energy Generation & Distribution, 2) Building & End Use Efficiency, 3) Transportation and Land Use, 4) Waste & Resource Recovery, 5) Food & Agriculture, and 6) Urban Ecosystems. Along with the sector breakout there are five strategies for GHG emissions reductions keyed to a specific sector: 1) decarbonize the electricity grid, 2) improve building operations, 3) change how people get around, 4) use less and waste less, and 5) focus locally.

Ms. Yeager's presentation was followed by a question-and-answer period where she fielded questions and comments from members of the committee. Significant comments included Pittsburgh's goal of reducing fossil fuel consumption and divestment, and the potential effect on jobs. A copy of Ms. Yeager's PowerPoint will be made available in PDF format on the CCAC's website.

ICF: Climate Action Plan Review of Climate and Energy Assessment Updates

Cory Jemison and Harry Vidas of ICF, Inc., were on hand to discuss ICF's Climate and Energy Plan Goals. The ICF presentation covered the Purpose, Approach, Findings and Key Decisions being used by ICF to develop Pennsylvania's 2018 updated Climate Action Plan (CAP). This process includes the informed selection of goals for the 2018 CAP along with providing an understanding of goals being set across the country, including the motivation and approach for setting them. The approach for the process involves identifying plans to review and the information to collect from the plans and reviewing the information as well as other resources. In all, ICF is reviewing 22 state plans, two regional plans and five local plans. Plans include 14 climate action plans, 12 energy plans and three others.

ICF reviewed the process for plan findings along with goal findings:

- Base-year goal types and goal development methods;
- Goal characteristics (attainability or aspirational); and
- Sector-specific goals along with adaptation/resilience goals.

Key decisions as to appropriate timeframes, broad or sector-specific, bottom-up or top-down perspective and motivation for goals were discussed with the committee.

ICF also updated the committee on the progress of the energy assessment. The objective of the analysis is to summarize and present statewide historical and projected business as usual energy production and consumption by sector and fuel type along with reflecting existing policies and identifying key trends and patterns. ICF's approach to this is to review existing energy production and consumption data, develop updated historical and projected production and consumption baseline estimates, and produce a task summary and spreadsheets. The analysis will also provide the foundation for the energy portion of the CAP inventory and projections. The Energy Assessment will provide the relationship with the CAP, and Pa Inventory and energy data elements will also provide historical and future energy consumption/expenditures.

The Energy Assessment will also provide data elements for electricity generation from fossil fuels, and renewable energy, pumped storage, nuclear, and CHP. The assessment will also include GHG/criteria air pollutant emissions and economic characteristics. A copy of ICF's PowerPoint will be made available in PDF format on the CCAC's website.

DEVELOPMENT OF THE 2018 CLIMATE CHANGE ACTION PLAN (Update):

The committee, the Department and ICF continue to discuss the development of the next UPDATE and Energy Assessment updates. Committee members offered their thoughts on the Energy Assessment, Energy Resource Assessment and Update strategies. The members had some suggestions about waste coal data, gross state product vs. per capita, criteria pollutants data, and natural gas emissions for combustion and/or feedstock. Questions were also raised about electric vehicle uptake into the electricity generation emissions analysis. The Department continues to have a regular weekly update conference call with ICF to discuss ongoing work with the Energy Assessment/Resource Analysis and Update.

ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS:

Post ICF's and the City of Pittsburgh's Department of City Planning PowerPoints to the CCAC website.

PUBLIC COMMENT(S):

Mr. Graff called for a resolution to thank Mark Brojakowski for his service to the Committee over the years and to acknowledge the Committee's appreciation for his work. The resolution is to be presented in the meeting minutes as a motion by Mr. Graff. The motion was seconded by Mr. Ellis and passed by voice vote.

ADJOURNMENT:

A motion to adjourn was made by Mr. Ellis and seconded. The motion carried, and the meeting was adjourned at 1:57 p.m.